# Building an Evidence Basis for S&T Policy

#### Understanding

#### develop usable knowledge and theories

#### Measurement

improve and expand science metrics, datasets and analytical models and tools

#### Community of Practice

cultivate a community of practice focusing on SciSIP across the academy, the public sector and industry

| Filter  | 195           |                                 |  |         |               |   |  |
|---------|---------------|---------------------------------|--|---------|---------------|---|--|
|         |               |                                 |  |         |               |   |  |
| Include | prop          | osals for selected Topics. U    | se the Summary sidebar to explore your selection.  |         |               |   |  |
| Topic   | c Dat         | a                               |  |         | Clear Selecti | × |  |
| Show    | 50            | entries                         | Keyword Filter:  |         | Export as CS  | P | Portfolio Summary  |
| Select  | Top           | iic <sup>©</sup>                |  | Awarded | Awarded       |   | he below reflects a summary of the Top<br>elect/ed on the left. Click the triangle cor |
|         |               |                                 |  | *       | Amt °         |   | expanded summaries or click the 'Explore<br>o analyze your selection deeper.           |
|         | proc          | cess technological productivity | t adoption invention citation inventor intellectual_property indicator innovator output measure diffusion product  | 36      | \$11.76M      | * | Institutions (464)   |
|         | pate          | inting innovate cited article   |  |         |               |   | Researchers (3727)   |
|         | com           | panies Corporation industrial   | r market investment industries economic business corporate<br>capital trade foreign profit economy economies ownership   | 21      | \$5.49M       | * | Awarded (103)  |
|         |               | uger                            |  |         |               |   | Total Funding: \$30.80M  |
|         | sam           |                                 | aracteristic Census measure empirical household panel<br>heterogeneity period control exogenous choice econometric   | 11      | \$3.84M       | * | Funding by Division<br>(top 8)   |
|         | 500           |                                 | al_science social public sociology policy Society STS expert<br>implication political technological dimension values<br>cal_science human                                  | 10      | \$2.22M       | * | SBE  |
|         | publ          |                                 | government public regulation regulatory agencies Federal<br>policymaker decision act legislation institutional private law   | 7       | \$1.44M       | * | SES 50.24M   |
|         | cond          |                                 | designer thinking innovation concept idea process product<br>ss creative_thinking processes space artifact pilot analogy   | 6       | \$1.93M       | + | OM 10M 20M 30M   |
|         | wirtu<br>man  | al_organization team_member     | anization organizational leadership management<br>reffectiveness processes virtual_team distributed theory<br>organizational_structure action socio_technical coordination | 6       | \$2.39M       |   | Funding by Topic<br>(top 8)  |
|         |               |                                 | ductivity cost consumption output aggregate policy period<br>um rms market economy export investment firm  | 4       | \$1.10M       | * | \$3,84M<br>140 \$2,39M<br>140 \$2,22M  |
| 1       | t90:<br>insti | Gender Diversity - women clim   | ate women_faculty gender leadership diversity advancement<br>ale policies equity rank position STEM women_stem   | 2       | \$0.62M       | ٠ | 1912<br>1942<br>1944<br>1994<br>1994<br>1994<br>1994<br>1994                           |

#### ➡ Portfolio Viewer

| Show 50 v entries      |                                      | Keyword Filter:                             |        |                     | t as CSV | Researchers by State |   |    |
|------------------------|--------------------------------------|---|--------|---------------------|----------|----------------------|---|----|
| 3110W 50 C             | nuies                                |   |        |                     |          |                      | - |    |
| Name 🌣                 | Institution ©                        | Department ©                                | Count* | IDs** 0             | Details  |                      |   |    |
| Lynne G Zucker         | University of California-Los Angeles | Sociology & Public Policy                   | 2      | 0830983,<br>1063988 | Þ        |                      |   | 2  |
| Alan L Porter          | Georgia Institute of Technology      | Public Policy                               | 2      | 0830207,<br>1064146 | Þ        |                      |   | P  |
| Kenneth Flamm          | Brookings Institution                | Economics                                   | 2      | 0830389,<br>0965013 |          | 3000                 |   |    |
| Lee Fleming            | Harvard University                   | Institute for Quantitative Social<br>Scienc | 2      | 0830287,<br>0965279 |          | 1- 9                 | • |    |
| Francisco Veloso       | Carnegie-Mellon University           | Engineering and Public Policy               | 2      | 0830233,<br>0738182 |          |                      |   |    |
| Ben Shneiderman        | University of Maryland College Park  | Department of Computer Science              | 1      | 0915645             | •        | Massachusetts        |   |    |
| Myron P Gutmann        | University of Michigan Ann Arbor     | ICPSR                                       | 1      | 0937370             | •        |                      |   |    |
| Michael R Darby        | University of California-Los Angeles | Anderson Graduate School of<br>Management   | 1      | 0830983             | •        | -                    |   |    |
| Martha E Crosby        | University of Hawaii                 | Dept of Info and Computer Sciences          | 1      | 0738208             |          |                      |   |    |
| Suzanne A<br>Scotchmer | University of California-Berkeley    | Institute of Business & Economic<br>Res.    | 1      | 0830186             | ►        | Georgia              |   |    |
| Larry Leslie           | University of Georgia                | Higher Education                            | 1      | 0830165             | ►        |                      |   |    |
| Gary L Bradshaw        | Mississippi State University         | Department of Psychology                    | 1      | 0915585             |          | 1                    |   |    |
| Sheila Slaughter       | University of Georgia                | Higher Education                            | 1      | 0830165             |          |                      |   | -  |
| Philip Shapira         | Georgia Tech Research Corporation    | School of Public Policy                     | 1      | 0738126             |          | California           |   | 6  |
| Robert Axtell          | George Mason University              | Computational Social Science                | 1      | 0915657             | Þ        |                      |   | L. |

9

### A LOT HAS BEEN LEARNED: EXAMPLE – 5 UNDERSTANDING SCIENCE INVESTMENTS

#### **Capturing Scientific Outcomes: Topic modelling** Automatically learned topics (e.g.): . . .



- t6. conflict violence war international military ...
- t7. model method data estimation variables ...
- t8. parameter method point local estimates ...

t9. optimization uncertainty optimal stochastic ...

t10. surface surfaces interfaces interface ...

t11. speech sound acoustic recognition human ... t12. museum public exhibit center informal outreach t13. particles particle colloidal granular material ... t14. ocean marine scientist oceanography ...

t49 t18 t114 t305

. . .

Topic tags for each and every proposal

6

# Automated capture of economic outcomes



# Conceptual frameworks developed

- Ideas Arise
  - Funding, infrastructure, regulation shocks? => exogenous variation
  - Individual activity? => mobility
  - Serendipity?
- are tested,
  - Review by peers (scientific journals)
  - Within firms
- mature,
  - Adoption
- and...make a significant impact
  - Economic? Social? Scientific?

### **Regulatory Shock**

#### Linking induced technological change, and environmental regulation: Evidence from patenting in the U.S. auto industry

#### Jaegul Lee<sup>a,\*</sup>, Francisco M. Veloso<sup>b,c,1</sup>, David A. Hounshell<sup>d,2</sup>

<sup>a</sup> School of Business Administration, Wayne State University, 320 Prentis Building, Detroit, MI 48202, United States

<sup>b</sup> Department of Engineering and Public Policy Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, United States

<sup>c</sup> Católica Lisbon – Business, Economics, 1649-023 Lisbon, Portugal

<sup>d</sup> Department of Social and Decision Science Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, United States

#### ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 16 April 2008 Received in revised form 21 May 2011 Accepted 9 June 2011 Available online 8 July 2011

Keywords: Technology-forcing regulations Environmental technologies Auto industry Environmental strategy

#### ABSTRACT

This article uses a carefully screened patent database in automobile emission control technologies and a detailed regulatory action analysis to examine firms' innovation in response to U.S. technologyforcing auto emissions standards enacted between 1970 and 1998. The study finds that under the *performance-based technology-forcing (PBTF)* auto emissions regulations, both automakers and component suppliers innovated and introduced more advanced emission control technologies for automobile applications. The study also shows that stringent PBTF regulation temporarily induced domestic U.S. firms to become more innovative than foreign firms that operated in the local U.S. market during the early phase of the regulatory regime. Findings of this research strongly imply that government intervention in the form of technology-forcing regulation can drive firms to invest in technological innovation.

© 2011 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

- Careful construction of patent database
- Knowledge of automobile technologies
- Initial description
- Analytical drivers

### Infrastructure Shock

Scientific freedom and openness are hallmarks of academia: relative to their counterparts in industry, academics maintain discretion over their research agenda and allow others to build on their discoveries. This paper examines the relationship between openness and freedom, building on recent models emphasizing that, from an economic perspective, freedom is the granting of control rights to researchers. Within this framework, openness of upstream research does not simply encourage higher levels of downstream exploitation. It also raises the incentives for additional upstream research by encouraging the establishment of entirely new research directions. In other words, within academia, restrictions on scientific openness (such as those created by formal intellectual property (IP)) may limit the diversity and experimentation of basic research itself. We test this hypothesis by examining a "natural experiment" in openness within the academic community: NIH agreements during the late 1990s that circumscribed IP restrictions for academics regarding certain genetically engineered mice. Using a sample of engineered mice that are linked to specific scientific papers (some affected by the NIH agreements and some not), we implement a differences-in-differences estimator to evaluate how the level and type of follow-on research using these mice changes after the NIH-induced increase in openness. We find a significant increase in the level of follow-on research. Moreover, this increase is driven by a substantial increase in the rate of exploration of more diverse research paths. Overall, our findings highlight a neglected cost of IP: reductions in the diversity of experimentation that follows from a single idea.

> Of mice and academics: Murray, Aghion, Dewatripont, Kolev and Stern Natural Experiment Careful difference in difference Careful hypothesis structuring

### Idea transmission as human activity

#### ABSTRACT

Are scientific knowledge flows embodied in individuals, or "in the air"? To answer this question, we measure the effect of labor mobility in a sample of 9,483 elite academic life scientists on the citation trajectories associated with individual articles (resp. patents) published (resp. granted) before the scientist moved to a new institution. We find that article-to-article citations from the scientific community at the superstar's origin location are barely affected by their departure. In contrast, article-to-patent citations, and especially patent-to-patent citations, decline at the origin location following a star's departure, suggesting that spillovers from academia to industry are not completely disembodied. We also find that article-to-article citations at the superstar's destination location markedly increase after they move. Our results suggest that, to be realized, knowledge flows to industry may require more face-to-face interaction than those to academics. Moreover, to the extent that academic scientists do not internalize the effect of their location decisions on the circulation of ideas, our results raise the intriguing possibility that barriers to labor mobility in academic science limit the recombination of individual bits of knowledge, resulting in a suboptimal rate of scientific exploration.

The Diffusion Of Scientific Knowledge Across Time And Space: Evidence From Professional Transitions For The Superstars Of Medicine (Azoulay, Graff-Zivin; Sampat)

- Focus on 10,450 elite life scientists
- Link individuals with their output
- Careful Difference in Difference estimates

## Identifying impact

- "When and how did we become certain that smoking causes cancer, coffee does not, and human activity is producing global climate change?"
- Shwed and Bearman: analyzed substantive cases that are now considered facts, such as the carcinogenicity of smoking and the non-carcinogenicity of coffee, and then employed that same analysis to two currently contested cases: the suspected carcinogenicity of cellular phones and the relationship between vaccines and autism.
- <u>http://understandingautism.columbia.edu/papers/t</u> <u>structure-of-scientific-consensus-formation.pdf</u>



### And..Building a better interagency system to answer agency questions STAR METRICS

Science and Technology in America's Reinvestment – Measuring the EffecTs of Research on Innovation, Competitiveness and Science

### What is STAR METRICS

• Six federal agencies; 85 research institutions

Goal:

- Provide a better empirical basis for science policy.
  - By providing an open and automated data infrastructure that can be used by federal agencies, research institutions, and researchers
  - By documenting federal investments in science and
  - By analyzing the resulting relationship between inputs, outputs, and outcomes.

Approach: automatically capture data about the conduct of science – inputs, outputs and the connections between the two



## Level II: Building an Evidence Basis: Going Beyond the Workforce

- A data platform that can link inputs and outputs/outcomes using automated approaches leveraging existing data
- Collaborative development of data infrastructure on broad categories of impact:
  - knowledge (e.g. publication, citations...)
  - economic (patents, spin off companies...)
  - workforce
    - social

- (employment, student mobility...)
- (e.g. health, environment, energy...)

### **Portfolio Characterization**

- For agencies
  - Gap analysis: What is being funded in which areas?
  - Expertise Locator: Who is doing research in which topics?
- For Researchers
  - Funding information: What programs are funding research like mine?
  - Expertise Locator: Who else is doing research like mine?
- For VPs for Research and their Institutions
  - Gap analysis: Where are my institutional research strengths?
  - Expertise Locator: How can I connect researchers?

Automatically generated from research proposals



#### Welcome

This site provides four tools that provide different views of scientific portfolios. The tools are provided by the <u>STAR METRICS</u> program; an interagency collaboration to provide a stronger empirical basis for science policy decisions.

#### Portfolio Viewer



The Portfolio Viewer provides information about portfolios at the program, division or directorate level based on scientific topics. You can view detailed information about proposals, awards, researchers and institutions. Detailed information is available at the left hand side of each page, summary statistics about selected areas is provided on the right hand side.

#### Expertise Locator



The Expertise Locator helps locate researchers who have submitted or been awarded proposals in different topic areas. The Expertise Locator provides detailed information on their proposals, their co-PIs and their institutions.

#### Patent Viewer



This tool provides information about patents that were received by NSF grantees. Users can view patent data by Division and/or Program Element Codes.

#### Map Viewer



This tool provides a geographic overview of NSF investments by institution and an earlier version of topics. It can be used to respond to requests on what research has been funded in what areas, as well as to understand the geographic dimensions of investments. A later release will update the topics to synchronize with the rest of the Portfolio Explorer tools.

#### Send Us Feedback

We would love to hear from you! Please email us at <u>PEfeetIback@nsf.gov</u> with any questions or feedback. If you have a problem to report, please include the url of the page you were on together with a description of what happened.

| C   |   | STAR N  | 1ETI  | RIC   | S Po  | ortfo  | olio I                              | Ex        | plorer version   |    |  |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|--|-------------------------------------|-----------|--|----|--|
| Hom   | e Portfolio   | Expertise   | Patents   | Мар   | os  |  |                                     |           | About Feedback   |    |  |
| Topic Filter  | 5   |   |   |   |   |  |                                     |           |  |    |  |
| This too<br>select (<br>Topi  | check) in the list below  |   | ion limits your   |   |   |  |                                     | of the    | researchers with awards in ANY of the Topics yo<br>e topics you select.  | 1  |  |
|   |   |   |   |   |   |  |                                     |           | Researcher Summary   |    |  |
| Show 50 entries Keyword Filter: tsu Export as CSV   Inclusion*: Awards matching ANY selected Topic Inclusion*: Awarded Awarded Declined |   |   |   |   |   |  |                                     | /         | The below reflects a summary of the Topics you<br>select/ed on the left. Click the triangle controls for<br>expanded summaries or click the 'Explore' button to<br>analyze your selection deeper.  |    |  |
| Select  | Topic *   |   |   | Awarded   | Awarded<br>Amt. 🗘   | Declined<br>≎  | Requested<br>Amt. ≎                 |           | Researchers (136) Explo  | re |  |
|   |   | sunami breaking wave_er<br>ave_propagation bottom s   |   | б0  | \$20.06M  | 89   | \$65.20M                            | •         | Awarded (60)   |    |  |
|   |   | n propagate depth standir   |   |   |   |  |                                     |           | Total Funding: \$20.06M  |    |  |
| Topic<br>propos<br>Please<br>togeth<br>Topics   | ng 1 to 1 of 1 entries (fi<br>Relevance: each proposal<br>sal, or b) based on all four<br>e note that the co-occurrin<br>er on proposals. While a g<br>s assigned to any of their p<br>L inclusion method only re | is assigned a total of 4 To<br>topics assigned to propos<br>g topics noted within each<br>ood indicator of expertise<br>vroposals (not just those v | ppics. The Topic<br>sals.<br>Topic\'s details<br>, please note tha<br>vith selected Top | view represe<br>t using the Al<br>vics assigned | pased on a) th<br>ent those Topi<br>LL inclusion m<br>I to individual p | e top/most rek<br>cs that co-occ<br>nethod yields re | ur most frequent<br>esearchers with | ich<br>ly | State     State <th< td=""><td></td></th<> |    |  |

0M 5M

10M 15M

| Home             | Portfoli                        | io Expertise   | Patents                                    | Maps   |   |                    |         | About                | Feedback           |
|------------------|---------------------------------|--|--|--------|---|--------------------|---------|----------------------|--------------------|
| Topics<br>Filter | 1 of <u>941</u><br>Timing: 2003 | t445: Tsunamis<br>7 -                                  |  |        |   |                    |         |                      | Change<br>Selectio |
| Expertis         | e Locator                       |  |  |        |   |                    |         |                      |                    |
| Researc          | hers                            |  |  |        |   |                    |         |                      |                    |
| Show 50          |                                 |  | Keyword Filter:                            |        |   | Export as          | s CSV   | Researchers by State |                    |
| PIID ≎           | Name 🗘                          | Institution $\hat{\mathbf{v}}$                         | Department 🗘                               | Count* | IDs** 🗘   |                    | Details |                      |                    |
| 00032701         | Philip L Liu                    | Cornell University                                     | Civil &<br>Environmental<br>Engineering    | 10     | 0710751, 0751079<br>0925711, 0960512<br>0723578, 0828552<br>0967003           | 1041541            | •       |                      |                    |
| 269824301        | Robert Weiss                    | Virginia Polytechnic Institute<br>and State University | Geosciences                                | 8      | <u>1136534, 1137611</u><br><u>1134926, 1135027</u><br><u>1056467, 1124295</u> | 0956094            | •       | 1 15                 | 1                  |
| 00013965         | Harry H Yeh                     | Oregon State University                                | Civil & Cnstr. Engrg.                      | 7      | 0742806, <u>1135768</u><br>0828552, <u>0935933</u><br>1129767                 |                    | •       | California           | 15                 |
| 00163080         | Solomon C<br>Yim                | Oregon State University                                | Civil and<br>Construction<br>Engineering   | δ      | <u>0723277</u> , <u>0800822</u><br><u>1037861</u> , <u>0830365</u>            |                    | •       | Texas                | 11                 |
| 69744680         | Hermann M<br>Fritz              | Georgia Tech Research<br>Corporation                   | GT-Savannah / CEE                          | 5      | 1034886, 0936603<br>1105577, 1135768  |                    | •       | Oregon               | 11                 |
| 00052129         | James H<br>Duncan               | University of Maryland<br>College Park                 | Department of<br>Mechanical<br>Engineering | 4      | 0962107, 0751853<br>0728770   | , <u>0928318</u> , | •       | Florida              | 10                 |
| 00160142         | Costas E<br>Synolakis           | University of Southern<br>California                   | Dept. of Civil<br>Engineering              | 4      | <u>1000694,</u> <u>1105577</u><br><u>1034886</u>                              | , <u>1135768</u> , | •       | New<br>York          | 10                 |
| 00193450         | Stephan T<br>Grilli             | University of Rhode Island                             | Department of<br>Ocean Engineering         | 4      | 0927014, 0940398<br>0830365   | , <u>0928293</u> , | •       | Rhode<br>Island      | в                  |
| 00204919         | Daniel T Cox                    | Oregon State University                                | Civil Engineering                          | 4      | 0723277, 0800822<br>1134971   | , <u>1005627</u> , | •       | Hawaii               |                    |
| 000225937        | Tetsu Hara                      | University of Rhode Island                             | Graduate School of<br>Oceanography         | 4      | 0824906, 0927014<br>0820872   | , <u>0940398</u> , | •       | Massachusetts        |                    |

## The pitfalls

- Need to paint full picture of scientific outcomes
  - => engagement of scientific community critical
  - => Open and transparent process
- Data misuse
  - => careful presentation of results
- Data quality
  - => full collaboration
  - => extensive use of pilots
- Confidentiality
  - => researcher, institution and agency controls

### **Ultimate Goals**

- Fully fledged academic field
- Fully fledged analytical tool set across government agencies
  - Science policy in same analytical tier as tax policy
- Common empirical infrastructure available to all universities and science agencies to quickly respond to State, Congressional and OMB requests
- Common scientific infrastructure for researchers to develop and study science policy

### Thank you

• Comments and questions?